

PT8 - Tender Award Report

This document is used to summarise the procurement process



Report Title	Planning and Regulatory Services Casework Management System (PRSCMS)
Report Author	Loredana Sandu (Category Manager, City Procurement)
Report Date	16/06/2021
Procurement Reference	prj_COL_18328 (itt_COL_14075)

<i>Key Area</i>	<i>Outcome</i>
Purpose of Report	Authorisation to award call-off contract
Tender Process	EU Procurement – Open Procedure (Regulation 27)
Proposed Provider	Idox Software Ltd.
Cost (inc. VAT)	Initial 5 years term - £375,107.50 ex VAT (£450,129 inc. VAT at 20%) Estimated Total contract value over the maximum possible contract length of 10 years: £624,005 ex VAT (£748,806 inc. VAT @20%)
Potential Risks	<ol style="list-style-type: none">Resources not being prioritised by the City to deliver according to the timescale, thus causing delays to the project plan which has an adverse effect on implementation dates.Resources not being prioritised by IDOX to deliver according to the timescale, thus causing delays to the project plan which has an adverse effect on implementation dates.Unforeseen delays or additional costs relating to the extraction of data from the existing Northgate system, however This is believed to be adequately mitigated through the combination of internal experience with the M3 database and the IDOX database (and indication of support from IDOX).

Detailed Summary

1. Summary

Details of what needs to be approved and a list of key areas covered by the report

- 1.1. This report seeks approval to award a contract for the provision of Planning and Regulatory Services Casework Management System (PRSCMS).
- 1.2. The tender has been advertised as two mutually exclusive lots:
Lot 1: Solution is hosted and supported in the supplier managed private or public cloud in the UK
Lot 2: Solution is hosted and supported in the City of London public cloud (Azure) but managed by the supplier
Bidders were allowed to make a submission to one or both of the lots and the City reserved the right in its absolute discretion to award only one of the two lots.
- 1.3. This tender award report will cover the tender evaluation as well as the proposed contract award resulting from a tender having been published under the EU Open Procedure (Regulation 27).
- 1.4. The proposed solution from the winning bidder will be hosted in the City of London public cloud (Azure) which is managed by Agilisys. The winning bidder will be responsible for the support and maintenance of the application layer. Additional support will be provided by the City of London IT, Application Support Team. This approach has been agreed with the IT Services representatives. The winning bidder will be providing a managed service including undertaking upgrades. Any Scheduled upgrades will require City of London IT assistance..

2. Recommendations

Details of who the contract is to be awarded to, proposed contract term, extensions and other relevant details

- 2.1 Based on the evaluation conducted by subject matter experts, as outlined in point 4.1.3 below, City Procurement would recommend the award of Lot 2 and appointment of Idox Software Ltd. for the provision of Planning and Regulatory Services Casework Management System (PRSCMS) as well as withdrawal of Lot 1. Further details can be found in section 4.3 below.
- 2.2 The Terms and Conditions applicable for the appointment are the City's Terms and Conditions as drafted by the Comptroller and City Solicitor's Department.

2.3 The proposed agreement will be awarded for a period of five years, with the option to extend for a further five years on a yearly basis.

2.4 Submissions were received as follows:

Lot 1: **Northgate Public Services (UK) Limited**

Lot 2: **Idox Software Ltd.**

3. Current Service Provision

Details of current supplier, contract arrangements, expiry dates and potential exit issues.

There are currently two service providers:

- (a) Northgate Public Services (UK) Limited provide the M3 product used in the Port Health and Public Protection sections of M&CP, and the Street Environment Team in DBE; and
- (b) Idox Software Ltd. provide the Uniform product used in Planning and Build Control parts of DBE.

The current agreements are on a rolling annual basis and are due to renew on 1 Apr 2022 for both IDOX Uniform and Northgate M3. As both existing agreements are rolling “annual” ones, their notice periods are 12 months.

4. Evaluation Summary

Overview of the tender process including SQ and ITT outcomes; evaluation criteria and weighting, evaluation outcomes including overview of the top 3 ranked suppliers.

4.1 Tender Evaluation

4.1.1 The following award criteria and weightings were agreed and were applied to both lots:

Technical Envelope 70% / Commercial Envelope 30%

The Technical Envelope weightings were split as follows:

No	Evaluation sections	Weighting % out of Quality total
1	IT, Hosting & Management	4.05%
2	Generic	7.30%
3	Implementation	3.65%
4	Public Access	4.86%
5	LLPG & LSG	2.43%
6	GIS (Spatial)	1.62%
7	Document Management	4.46%
8	Contact Centre	1.62%
9	Planning	23.33%
10	Building Control	11.67%
11	Port Health and Public Protection	35.00%
12	Responsible Procurement	5%
13	Long Questions - unscored	For information only
14	Mandatory (P1) questions	Pass/Fail
15	Required (P2) Yes/No questions	Pass/Fail
16	Desirable (P3) Yes/No questions	Pass/Fail
Total out of 70% Quality score		100%

4.1.2 All tender returns have been evaluated on a like for like basis using the award criteria as set out in paragraph 4.1.1.

4.1.3 The tender questions were evaluated and scored by stakeholders as outlined within the Tender Evaluation Guidance document.

Technical envelope:

Department of Built Environment:

Richard Steele – Information Manager
Andrew Kendrick – Senior District Surveyor’s Support Officer
Gideon Stothard – Town Planning Assist
Richard Tranter – Planning Spatial Data Analyst
Halil Siddique – GIS / Web Mapping Officer

David Horkan – Assistant Director Planning Development

Tim Gillooly – Assistant Director Surveyors

Department of Markets & Consumer Protection:

Tony Macklin – Assistant Director Environmental Health & Public Protection

Andrew Green – Operational Support Team Manager

Sharon Edwards / Joel Theobald – Animal Health Inspector

Peter Brett – Commercial Environmental Health Team Manager

Aggie Minas – Licensing Officer

Robin Whitehouse – Pollution Team Manager

Claire Callan-Day – Street Environment Officer

Steve Playle – Trading Standards Manager

Corporation Contact Centre:

David Perry – Contact Centre Team Leader

Chamberlain's Department – IT Services:

David Clelland – IT Solutions Architect

Commercial envelope:

Chamberlain's Department – City Procurement:

Loredana Sandu - Category Manager

4.1.4 No conflicts of interest have been declared regarding the Procurement Process.

4.1.5 Sustainability is an important aspect to the City of London Corporation and was addressed within Question 12 Responsible Procurement for both Lot 1 and Lot 2.

4.2 Tender Results

4.2.1 Based on the scoring criteria indicated in paragraph 4.1.1 above, the assessment result is as follows:

Lot 1 SaaS	TENDERERS
AWARD CRITERIA	Northgate
Compliance	
Form of Tender	PASS
Pass/Fails criteria	PASS
London Living Wage	PASS
Technical Envelope	
Total Quality Weighted Score:	50.96
Commercial Envelope	
Value	£738,142.86
Total Price Weighted Score:	30.00
Total Weighted Score:	80.96
Order of Tenders:	1
Lot 2 Hosted within Azure	TENDERERS
AWARD CRITERIA	Idox
Compliance	
Form of Tender	PASS
Pass/Fails criteria	PASS
London Living Wage	PASS
Technical Envelope	
Total Quality Weighted Score:	53.91
Commercial Envelope	
Value	£375,107.50
Total Price Weighted Score:	30.00
Total Weighted Score:	83.91
Order of Tenders:	1

4.3 Tender Award decision

4.3.1 Based on the tender results listed in 4.2.1 above and following discussions with the subject matter experts outlined in 4.1.3, the following arguments and observations have been made prior to making a decision:

- a) The sole supplier on Lot 2 (IDOX) has achieved a higher quality percentage than the sole supplier on Lot 1 (Northgate) out of the maximum available on each respective lot.
- b) Under each of the two lots there has been only one bid submitted, therefore the respective supplier on each lot would automatically be awarded full marks for the Commercial envelope.
- c) Taking into account the hosting (Azure) costs under Lot 2 and other associated IT costs under both lots (which will be covered by the City outside of this agreement) the relative pricing, outlined in Section 5 below, shows a difference of only £500.50 between the total costs , including associated costs, for the two submissions.
- d) Following evaluation, the IT representative has stated that both providers have the capability to deliver the requirements.

4.3.2 The following are observations made in relation to the submission made by Northgate Public Services (UK) Limited under **Lot 1: Solution is hosted and supported in the supplier managed private or public cloud in the UK:**

- a) The submission did not provide enough evidence to reassure the evaluation team that the public access solution proposed is reliable and fit for purpose. In addition, the test environment crashed several times during testing. The public access is required by statute/regulation for Planning.
- b) The software spatial data offering seems to be something of a bolt-on and lacks maturity.
- c) The inclusion of a separate LLPG & LSG maintenance system (Aligned Assets) within the proposal means there is a lack of seamless integration (requiring some data currently held in the incumbent system to be held externally going forward). It has just been announced that Aligned Assets has been taken over by Idox Software Ltd. (the supplier under Lot 2) which raises risks relating to availability in both the short and longer term.
- d) Migration from the incumbent IDOX software to Northgate would require significantly more data conversion than migration from the incumbent Northgate software to IDOX because IDOX holds significantly more data generally and more complex data.

4.3.3 The following are observations made in relation to the submission made by Idox Software Ltd. under **Lot 2: Solution is hosted and supported in the City of London public cloud (Azure) but managed by the supplier:**

- a) The solution has a mature and fully integrated spatial data management system, a mature and fully integrated Gazetteer Management System, a fully integrated textual and spatial system, and an industry standard Public Access portal.
- b) The proposal still requires some input from IT Services which has been discussed with IT and they are content to accommodate it.
- c) The mobile version of the solution is not available on mobile phone-sized devices, only tablets and laptops so it may be necessary to procure an integration with iAuditor (which has the benefit of allowing those users to continue to use their well-established tool which was developed in house) however this has been discussed with the subject matter experts and they are prepared to accept the implications. The cost of the integration can be contained within the approved implementation budget.

Pricing overview, including cost type (fixed cost, schedule of rates etc) and cashable and non-cashable savings achieved.

1. Efficiency achieved through consolidation of solutions: M3 (provided by Northgate Public Services (UK) Limited and used in the Port Health & Public Protection Division of M&CP, and the Street Environmental Team in of DBE) and Uniform (provided by Idox Software Ltd. and used in Planning and Build Control divisions of DBE).
2. Efficiencies to be realised through use of spatial data not currently available within the incumbent Northgate M3 platform.
3. Wider cross-reporting capabilities arising from a single database.
4. Expected reduction of hosting and support costs due to a reduction in the number of IT systems from 2 to 1.
5. Improved efficiencies and real time data via the enhanced functionally available through mobile apps.
6. On a like for like basis, there are small revenue savings to be realised over the initial 5 years contract term as per tables below. It may be that there will be a requirement to provide an interface to the iAuditor system as part of the on-boarding (this is likely to be the case whichever bid is accepted) and this is not included below.

Recommended solution (Lot 2 Idox)	Capital (£)	Revenue (£)					5 Year Total (£)
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	
Idox Mobilisation * ¹	126,210.00						375,107.50* ⁶
IDOX Uniform, DMS and Managed service * ²		49,779.50	49,779.50	49,779.50	49,779.50	49,779.50	
IT Setup costs * ^{1,5}	43,600.00						43,600.00
Azure Hosting * ^{3,4}		45,000.00	45,000.00	45,000.00	45,000.00	45,000.00	225,000.00
IT revenue costs * ³		18,000.00	18,000.00	18,000.00	18,000.00	18,000.00	90,000.00
IT Agilisys Support uplift (P2 to P1 Application) * ³		5,000.00	5,000.00	5,000.00	5,000.00	5,000.00	25,000.00
Total ex VAT	169,810.00	117,779.50	117,779.50	117,779.50	117,779.50	117,779.50	758,707.50

*2 – to be met by Environment Dept from revenue Local Risk

*4 - based on the existing number of servers, it is anticipated that fewer servers will be required – savings of the order of at least £5,000 pa should be made.

*⁶ – this value is the bid value under Lot 2 as indicated in point 4.2.1

[illegible]

Idox & Northgate (current cost)	Capital (£)	Revenue (£)					5 Year Total (£)
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	
Idox (Uniform / Doc Mgt)		43,153.27	43,153.27	43,153.27	43,153.27	43,153.27	
Northgate (M3)		19,734.13	19,734.13	19,734.13	19,734.13	19,734.13	
Azure Hosting		45,595.44	45,595.44	45,595.44	45,595.44	45,595.44	
IT Costs		40,000.00	40,000.00	40,000.00	40,000.00	40,000.00	
Total ex VAT		148,482.84	148,482.84	148,482.84	148,482.84	148,482.84	
							742,414.20

Budget approval:**7. Overall Project**

On 5 Jul 2018 the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee and the Policy & Resources Committee approved a project cost for the first 5 years of £900,000. The project costs of £758,707.50 for the first 5 years identified above fall within this. There is likely to be departmental staff cost associated with the implementation and there may be a requirement for an additional integration with an existing system – the total cost of these will not exceed £141,292.50 and therefore the project will not exceed the approved expenditure.

8. Capital

The capital element approved by Resource Allocation Sub-Committee and the Policy & Resources Committee on 5 Jul 2018 was £500,000. The capital costs identified above are £169,810.00 and even if the full amount of additional costs identified in the previous paragraph (£141,292.50) were to be incurred, the capital expenditure cannot exceed £311,102.50 - which is less than the approved amount.

9. Revenue

The future annual revenue costs, as shown above, are expected to be £117,779.50

This will be met from existing local risk resources as follows:

Local Risk	Current	Future	Comment on "future"
DBE	43,153.27	49,779.50	Reported as one amount because: (i) DBE and PH&PP currently have the same Chief Officer and the same Head of Finance; and (ii) following the implementation of the TOM, DBE and EH&PP will both be in the "Environment" department.
PH&PP Division of M&CP	19,734.13		
IT	85,595.44	68,000.00	The future costs are estimates.
Total	148,482.84	117,779.50	

6. Lessons Learnt

N/A

7. Contract Management Plan

Details of persons managing the contract covering roles and responsibilities of individual staff.

Richard Steele (DBE Information Manager) will oversee the overall Management of the Contract, with support from IT Services and the Commercial Contract Management Team where required and applicable. He will also be supported by Tony Macklin (M&CP Assistant Director (Public Protection)) as Co-lead for the Project Team.

8. Approval Sign Off

Name of Approver	Richard Steele and Tony Macklin
Position	Richard Steele (DBE Information Manager) and Tony Macklin (Assistant Director (Public Protection))
Date approved	24/06/2021
Approver comments	